WORK SUPPORTS AND HEALTH: WORK SCHEDULING

MAY 14, 2020

Policies for Action

Policy and Law Research to Build a Culture of Health
HEIDI HARTMANN, PH.D.

SENIOR RESEARCH ECONOMIST, IWPR
EDITOR, JOURNAL OF WOMEN, POLITICS & POLICY

Chet Susslin/National Journal
IWPR Webinar on Work Supports and Health: Work Scheduling, May 14 2020

Summary of Recent Research Findings with Jaeseung Kim (with Pronita Gupta for CLASP, EPI) and the University of Illinois’ Project for Middle Class Renewal (with Bob Bruno, Alison Dickson and Adam Okulicz-Kozaryn) and ILO (with Florence Bonnet)

Lonnie Golden Lmg5@psu.edu
Spectrum of Work Scheduling—from total to no control over hours or schedules

**Time Sovereignty**: individual decision latitude, *discretion*, *autonomy* in scheduling work across day, week, year, life cycle...

- Fixed, but predictable timing

- Variability, unpredictability: set according to employer needs, with no advance notice of changes
Economists’ Foundation: Well-being (“Utility” etc.) -- for a given level of income ($Y$) and volume of non-work time ($L$, leisure), but, it depends also on the:

1) **timings** (scheduling) -- of given amount of work and non-work time
2) gap between **desired** vs. actual hours or schedule (“constraints, “incongruence” “mismatch”)
3) ability to close those gaps, i.e., adjust, **control**, ease of **transitioning**

$$U = U \left[ Y, L ; V, \delta, \lambda \right]$$

4 aspects of problematic work hours and schedules -- to try to **measure**, including the **interactions** among them:

1) **inadequacy** of hours (too few, underemployment, wants more work hours);
2) **instability** of hours (too volatile, unwelcome variable ($V$) work and often, earnings);
3) **unpredictability** of hours and schedules (too uncertain/late notice);
4) **inflexibility** of hours and schedules (too little employee input/control/unresponsiveness to desired changes).
Why Should We Care? Consequences of **Mismatches**—on Individuals

**Under-employment and over-employment** both result in reduced aspects of well-being:

-- **general health** (Cho, 2017);

-- **mental health** (Angrave and Charlwood, 2015; Bell and Blanchflower, 2019; Zukin and van Horn, 2015).

-- **physical health** (Friedland and Price, 2003).

  Mental health effects larger than physical health (Webber, 2019)

-- **psychological distress, poor sleep quality** (Schneider and Harknett, 2019)

-- **work-to-family conflict** (Cho, 2018; Reynolds, 2014; Lambert and Henly, 2014; Gornick and Frase, 2012).


Conventional labor **economics** discounts mismatches, assumed to generate **Compensating Wage Differentials** ("hazard pay" now) however, scant empirical support for a CWD (Weeden, 2005; McCrate, 2005; Heywood, 2009) absent for **hourly** paid jobs/lower incomes (Henly and Lambert, 2010; Williams and Huang, 2010).

**exception** for “**unsocial**” nontraditional work timing (Mas and Pallais, 2017)

Currently, both overemployment and underemployment appear to be escalating during the Covid-19 Crisis
5 Indicators (Practices):
1) Hours Inadequacy (Involuntary Part Time work)
2) Irregular shift times/Variable hours and schedules
3) On-call work
4) (Lack of) Hours and Schedule Input, Control; 5) Mandatory Overtime work

5 Outcomes for Workers:
- Health -- General
- Work Stress
- Work-Family Conflict
- (Un)happiness
- Underemployment (as an outcome)
Illinois (PMCR, 2017) sample – having on-call shifts is higher (45%) among those employed part time (and temps and contractors)
In Illinois (PMCR, 2017), among all those who work on-call shifts “regularly” or “sometimes,” the underemployment rate is 56 percent, versus only 44 percent among those who never work on call.
More evidence that the more **Irregular** is one’s work scheduling, the higher is **underemployment** (Golden and Kim, General Social Survey (GSS) 2016 data)

I have a **regular** schedule or shift (daytime, evening, or night)
I have a schedule or shift which **regularly changes** (for example, from days to evenings or to nights)
I have a schedule where daily working times are **decided at short notice by employer**
In general, how would you rate your health?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>Very good</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Fair</th>
<th>Poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Is your MAIN job considered a regular full-time, part-time, or something else (temporary job, independent contractor)?

| n | 3,236 | 466 | 1,064 | 1,156 | 500 | 50 |

Regular (standard) full-time employee

| 74.1% | 75.3% | 76.6% | 74.8% | 67.2% | 62.0% |
| D, E | D, E | D, E |

Regular part-time employee

| 20.2% | 18.9% | 18.7% | 19.4% | 25.0% | 36.0% |
| A, B, C | A, B, C |

Temporary, such as direct hire temp or by a temp agency, by contract or leasing company, or day laborer

| 2.3% | 2.4% | 1.4% | 2.6% | 3.8% | 0.0% |
| B | B |
How About Work to Family Time Conflict?
Association of having work shifts that are “irregular or on-call,” with frequency of work to family conflict (Golden and Kim, 2017, using GSS)—a smooth gradation
### OLS Regressions, controlling for workers’ work and demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(N=6542)</th>
<th>Job Stress</th>
<th>Work-to-Family Conflict</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coeff</td>
<td>Coeff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Day shift (ref.)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afternoon/night shift</td>
<td>-0.020</td>
<td>-0.054</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Split/rotate shift</td>
<td>0.021</td>
<td>-0.024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irregular/on-call shift</td>
<td>0.133**</td>
<td>0.102*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>R²</strong></td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Irregular/on-call** shift working is associated positively with **Work Stress**

Irregular/on-call (and other, non-daytime) shift work is associated with more frequent **Work-Family Conflict** (Intensified by being employed in Retail, Health and Food services)

**Part time** work reduces somewhat the degree of work-family conflict for those on irregular schedules and split/rotating shifts (interaction effects)

Cannot rule out **endogeneity** that such workers choose to take, get or stay in jobs that provide unstable schedules.....
Underemployment among the part time (PTU) ? with 4 novel definitions (Golden and Kim, 2020, for CLASP, GSS 2016 data)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Odds Ratios of Being Part-time Underemployed:</th>
<th>Work Stress</th>
<th>Job Interference with Family</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Relative to full-timers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU1</td>
<td>0.860</td>
<td>1.452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU2</td>
<td>0.759</td>
<td>2.718*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU3</td>
<td>0.882</td>
<td>1.643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU4</td>
<td>0.602</td>
<td>1.029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative to voluntary part-timers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU1</td>
<td>2.192*</td>
<td>3.763*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU2</td>
<td>2.019^</td>
<td>6.908***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU3</td>
<td>3.377**</td>
<td>3.517*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU4</td>
<td>1.891</td>
<td>1.487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Just among part-timers: involuntary relative to voluntary part-timers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU1</td>
<td>2.821^</td>
<td>2.602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU2</td>
<td>2.442^</td>
<td>9.298**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU3</td>
<td>5.081**</td>
<td>7.599*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTU4</td>
<td>2.405</td>
<td>1.182</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Underemployed part-time workers experienced more:

-- work stress than voluntary part-time workers (indeed, their stress is on par with full-time workers.)
-- work-family conflict than voluntary part-timers (also, have no less work-family conflict than full timers)
Health? Given endogeneity problem, using panel (SIPP 2015-16) data, to control for one’s recent health, to see effect of both:

1) Working part time INVOLUNTARILY—do have 30% lower odds of experiencing good mental health in last 30 days
2) Working non-traditional schedule—if it is night/evening shift time

### Table. The Association between Part-time Employment and Self-rated Health (very good/excellent)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Predictors</th>
<th>Model 1</th>
<th>Model 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Work schedule (ref. day shift)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Night/evening shift</td>
<td>0.78***</td>
<td>0.84*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Split/rotate shift</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irregular shift</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self-rated health (wave 1)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Working hours per week</strong></td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The reasons for part-time (ref. full-time)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Involuntary PT</td>
<td>0.73***</td>
<td>0.72**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary PT</td>
<td>1.25**</td>
<td>1.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT due to health constraints</td>
<td>0.14***</td>
<td>0.19***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT for family/schools</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>0.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short full-time (&lt; 35hours)</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.74*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N=18,538.
Variable, Unstable Hours? Happiness is Flextime, Unhappiness is Unstable Hours (Okulicz-Kozaryn and Golden, with GSS, 2016, 2018 data)

--the closer the **shortest** is to one’s **usual** working week (“least hours per week past month/usual hours”), the **higher** is one’s **happiness**;

--to an even greater extent, the **longer** the longest week is compared to usual (“most hours per week past month/usual hours”), the **lower** is **happiness**.
Irregular Scheduling leads to more frequent Underemployment

Irregular scheduling and Underemployment are both associated with more frequent **mental health** problems, work **stress** and frequent **work-family conflict**

**Underemployment** for part-time workers is pernicious to well-being, entirely about its involuntariness than shorter hours

**Unstable** Hours is associated with lower happiness

Such work scheduling and their consequences could be addressed with innovative public **policies**, being enacted or considered
Policy Formulation— preventing unwelcome downward adjustments and facilitating upward hours adjustments—part of “Fair Workweek” (Secure or Predictive Scheduling, “Schedules That Work Act” and recent “Part Time Workers’ Bill of Rights:

1) **ACCESS to HOURS** — first San Jose, NYC, OR…proposed in Chicago, Philadelphia…NJ

2) **Right to Request a** Flexible Working Arrangement, a modified Work Schedule, including …additional shifts or hours; changes in days of work or shift start and/or end times; permission to exchange shifts with other Employees; limitations on availability; part-time employment

3) Establishing “**minimum hours**” requirements, Washington, D.C., first “**guaranteed minimum hours**” law establishing a 30-hour minimum workweek for janitors in large commercial buildings; Proposed in Jersey City, NJ.
WHO CARES (FOR CHILDREN) WHEN PARENTS’ WORK SCHEDULES ARE UNPREDICTABLE?: EVIDENCE FROM THE SHIFT PROJECT

Kristen Harknett, UCSF
Daniel Schneider, UC Berkeley
Sigrid Luhr, UC Berkeley

Project Directors
Daniel Schneider
UC Berkeley
dischneider@berkeley.edu

Kristen Harknett
UC San Francisco
kristen.harknett@ucsf.edu
THE CHANGING NATURE OF WORK

- **Risk Shift** (Hacker 2006)
- **Polarization – Good Jobs/Bad Jobs** (Kalleberg 2009; Fligstein & Shin 2004)
- Decline in manufacturing and unionization, increase in service sector jobs
- **The Rise of the 24/7 economy** (Presser 1999; McMenamin 2007)
- **Scheduling Software**

https://shift.berkeley.edu/
Quality and stability of care arrangements matters for child behavior and development (Morrissey 2009; Chaudry 2004; Brooks-Gunn et al. 2002; Pilarz and Hill 2014)

Low-income working parents often have low quality and complex child care arrangements (Henly and Lyons 2000)

Non-Standard Schedules reduce child wellbeing (i.e. Gassman-Pines; Han) and marital quality (i.e. Presser)

Unstable and unpredictable schedules Increase work-life conflict (Henly and Lambert, 2014), interfere with parenting (Haley-Lock and Posey-Maddox, 2014)

Intergenerational consequences of unstable work schedules
FILLING A GAP: USING FACEBOOK FOR SURVEY RECRUITMENT

Advertisement
↓
Click
↓
Qualtrics Landing Page
↓
Consent
↓
Complete Survey

UC Berkeley Work and Family Study

Working at CVS? Take a short survey and tell us about your job!

Chance to win an iPad!

BERKELEY.QUALTRICS.COM

27 Reactions 13 Comments
• 20 minute online survey
  • Work, Schedules, Demographics, Economic Security, Health, Parenting, Child care
• Workers 18+ years at large retail and food employers
• Incentive – lottery or gift card
• 2016 - 2020
• 100,000 workers
• 120 large companies

“What’s to Like? Facebook as a Tool for Survey Data Collection” *Sociological Methods and Research*
National data

Linked employer-employee

City evaluations

Workers nested within large companies allows for analysis of company practices

Large enough samples to study geographic variation

Hourly workers in the service sector
SHIFT NATIONAL DATA: SUBSAMPLE OF PARENTS WITH YOUNG KIDS

- Parents with children 0 to 9 in the household
- Employed at ~116 large retail or food service employers
- Not missing on key variables
- Surveyed in Spring 2017, Fall 2017, and Spring 2018

- N = 3,653
EXPOSURE TO "JUST IN TIME" SCHEDULING

• ON-CALL

“In the past month or so, have you ever been asked to be "on-call" for work at [EMPLOYER NAME]? By "on-call", we mean you have to be available to work, and you find out if you are needed to work just a few hours before your shift.”

• SHIFT CHANGE

“In the past month or so, did your employer ever change the timing or the length of your scheduled shift at [EMPLOYER NAME]? For example, your employer asked you to come in early or late, or asked you to leave early or to stay later than the hours you were originally scheduled for.”

- On-call: 28%
- Shift change: 68%
JUST-IN-TIME SCHEDULING ASSOCIATED WITH CHILD CARE ARRANGEMENTS?

Regress CARE on JUST IN TIME SCHEDULING using OLS or LPM

with and without Inverse Probability of Treatment Weights

Control for

• Job Characteristics (wages, hours, notice, schedule type, schedule control, job tenure, and managerial status)

• Parent and Household Characteristics — (age, spouse or partner, race/ethnicity, education, number of kids, age of youngest and oldest child)

• Household resources (income and ability to cope with a $400 expense shock)

• Seasonality
Figure 1. Child Care Arrangements by Just in Time Scheduling (weighted by inverse probability of treatment) 

The left bar (0) is those with no on-call or shift changes. The right bar (JIT) is those with both on-call and shift changes. Number is types of care; Self is child left alone; Self/Yg Sib is child left alone or w/ sibling < 10 years; Formal is daycare or school-based care.
Children of parents with unstable schedules experience varied care arrangements

Parents who work on-call or experience last minute shift changes in the U.S. have a greater number of care arrangements, which is harmful to their children's development because of inconsistency in care.

Parents with just-in-time schedules struggle to find childcare

Number of days per year in which young children of U.S. food and retail workers receive childcare from a sibling younger than 10 years of age or lack childcare (for any period of time)

Parents without on-call or last-minute schedule changes*  
9 days annually

Parents who work on-call and experience last-minute schedule changes  
15 days annually

* These parents may experience other scheduling practices that impact childcare, such as receiving their schedule less than a week in advance.


Equitable Growth
Emeryville is the third city to guarantee humane scheduling for its workers
Emeryville unanimously passed the country’s third fair scheduling law.

NEW YORK (Reuters) - New York on Tuesday became the third and largest major U.S. city to guarantee a measure of scheduling smoothness to fast food workers, whose lives are often disrupted by last-minute changes based on their employers’ manpower needs.

City Council approves Chicago’s ‘fair workweek’ ord
workers must get two weeks’ notice of their schedule.

Seattle City Council approves worker-scheduling law
Seattle becomes the second major U.S. city to regulate how large retailers and food-service employers schedule their workers.
One-Year Impact of Scheduling Ordinance for Seattle Workers

- Two Weeks Notice
- Pay for Timing Change

Percentage point increase
A CROSSROADS: RETRENCHMENT OF LABOR PROTECTION?
OR EXPANSION OF SOCIAL SAFETY NET?

Customers pick up orders at a Shake Shack Inc. restaurant in Philadelphia before the coronavirus pandemic. The city’s Fair Workweek ordinance takes effect April 1, requiring some businesses to give advance notice on scheduling changes.

By Victor J. Blue/Bloomberg via Getty Images

Philadelphia Worker Scheduling Law Takes Effect During Pandemic

March 31, 2020, 10:01 AM

- City suspends extra pay mandate; rest of law effective April 1
- Hard-hit restaurant industry urging NYC to suspend similar law

By Michelle Goldberg
Opinion Columnist

The New Great Depression Is Coming. Will There Be a New New Deal?

After the coronavirus, political transformation may be inevitable.

May 2, 2020
Thanks!

**Project Staff:** Megan Collins, Nan Cramer, Connor Williams

**Grad Students:** Carmen Brick, Allison Brooke, Megan Collins, Josh Choper, Paul Chung, Alison Gemmill, Veronique Irwin, Kirstin Krussell, Sigrid Luhr, Robert Pickett, Adam Storer, Garrett Strain, Rebecca Wolfe, and Ugur Yildirim

**Under Grads:** Nick Garcia, Lambert Li, Marianne Motus, Michael Obuchi, Reuben Sarwhal, Brenna Simmons, Tom Haseloff, and Lisa Tarasyuk

About UFCW

1.3 million workers in the U.S and Canada

- Grocery
- Non-food retail
- Food processing
- Chemical
- Cannabis
- Distillery
- Health care
UFCW Fighting for Fair Schedules

Has lost its way...

H&M used to be a good company to work for and a good corporate citizen. But something has changed.

Workers at H&M Deserve:
Better Pay
Fair Scheduling
Adequate Health Coverage
An End to Closings – where workers who close the store then have to open it the next day

But H&M is refusing to bargain in good faith with the workers, according to Unfair Labor Practice charges filed with the government. Tell H&M that you expect better.

Call H&M at (855-466-7467) and let them know it’s time to reach a fair contract!

union contracts improve scheduling

Workers at supermarkets in Kentucky and Ohio got in writing that their store must give 14 days advanced notice for employee schedules.

#GetItInWriting!
Federal Fair Scheduling Legislation

Schedules that Work Act
- Sponsored by Sen. Warren (MA) and Rep. DeLauro (CT)
- Introduced Nov 5, 2019

Part Time Worker Bill of Rights
- Sponsored by Sen. Warren (MA) and Rep. Schakowsky (IL)
- Introduced Dec 3, 2019
Guarantees workers the right to request a schedule change without fear of retaliation

Requires that employers *grant* requests made for reasons related to caregiving responsibilities, one’s own medical needs, a second job, or education/training

Gives workers the right to know their schedule in advance

Require additional pay if schedules are changed with inadequate notice

Guaranteed adequate time between shifts to rest.
Part Time Workers Bill of Rights

• Require large employers to offer available hours to current, available, qualified part-time employees before hiring new employees or subcontractors.

• Make more part-time employees eligible for family and medical leave.

• Allow part-time workers to participate in their employers' pension plans.
Fair Scheduling Laws in the States

1 statewide and 6 Local

- Oregon
- San Francisco
- Emeryville
- Chicago
- New York
- Philadelphia
- Seattle

Key elements

- Targets low wage workers. i.e. hospitality, restaurants, fast food and retail.
- Requires
  - Advance notice of schedules
- Forbids
  - last-minute shift additions or cancellations
  - on-call shifts
9 states prohibit cities and counties from passing any local ordinances relating to fair scheduling.
- MI, IA, IN, OH, KS, AR, TN, AL, GA

Battling preemption

6 states introduced
- Hawaii
- Minnesota
- Oklahoma
- Maryland
- California
- Michigan

None enacted
U.S. employers shed **20,500,000 total jobs** in April....

[Graph showing Retail Trade from 2007 to 2020]

[https://www.bloomberg.com/graphics/jobs-numbers/?sref=vuYGislZ]
Food workers are on the front lines

• Food workers required to work during this crisis.

• Food workers are “essential workers” on the front lines of this battle.

• Not only our gratitude but adequate protection and provision for their health, safety and financial security.
Policies that Will Help Retail

- Fair Scheduling
- Priority COVID-19 testing
- In-store safety measures
- Health care coverage
- Personal protective equipment (PPE)
- Paid leave
- #ShopSmart

Wear a mask when you shop, even if it’s homemade.

#SHOPSMART
Questions?

Rachel Lyons
rlyons@ufcw.org
Deputy Legislative Director
Human Error: The Future of Work is Now

Stable Schedules are better for workers & better for business. The technology isn’t hard to fix. So why isn’t it?
Why Today’s Shopping Sucks

The rise of on-demand scheduling has made the shopping experience—and workers' lives—miserable.

by Brigid Schulte

Nick Sirota
Families “Held Hostage”

- Financial precarity
- Instability for entire family
- High stress, anxiety
- Psychological distress
- Hopelessness
Childhood: Disrupted

- Informal care settings
- Instability
- Behavior problems
- Lower wellbeing
- Exacerbates inequality
“It’s really stressful to have no control over disorganized time.”

Daniel Schneider, UC Berkeley, SHIFT Project Co-Director
When Your Boss is an Algorithm

Vincent Tsui for HBR
“Technology isn’t creating this, it’s exacerbating existing underlying social problems”

- Aiha Nguyen, Data & Society Research Institute
The Rise of the “Crappy Job”

- Part-time hours
- Low pay
- No benefits
- No path to advance
- Open availability
- Schedule “Sharecropping”
It’s almost as if the software were designed expressly to punish low-wage workers and to keep them down,”

- Cathy O’Neil, author of Weapons of Math Destruction
You Can Program Stability
Gap Study: Stability is Better for Business

- $2.9 million increased revenue
- 7% increased sales
- 5% increased productivity
- 4-6% decreased turnover

-Stable Schedules Study, Center for Work-Life Law, University of Chicago, UNC Kenan-Flagler Business School
“It’s so strange. It’s almost like cutting off our nose to spite our face.”

- Bob Clements, president of the Axsium Group, global workforce management consulting firm
Shifting Mindset: The True Cost of Instability
What Works: Good Jobs Strategy

• Schedule with values:
  • Worker wellbeing
  • Customer connection
  • Long-term outcomes
  • Worker input
  • Advance notice
  • Creative solutions
  • Cross training
“Everyone is happier. Everyone sleeps better. The atmosphere at the store is so much better for workers and managers,”

- Ashley Worthen, Albertson’s